Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers
Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine
A Webber Training Teleclass

Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers
Keith F. Woeltje, MD, PhD
Professor of Medicine, Infectious Diseases
Washington University School of Medicine
Director, Clinical Advisory Group,
BJC HealthCare Center for Clinical Excellence

Overview
- Influenza Epidemiology
- Influenza Vaccination of HCWs
- Benefits and Barriers to "going mandatory"
- BJC experience:
  - 2008 – 09
  - Update from 2009 – 10
  - Others’ experience

Influenza Epidemiology
- >200,000 influenza associated hospitalizations per year
- ~36,000 excess deaths per year
- Leading cause of vaccine-preventable death in US every year
- Asymptomatic infections occur
- Viral shedding precedes symptom onset
- HCWs work sick

Influenza in Healthcare Settings
- Outbreaks – hospital and long-term care
- Nosocomial transmission
- Exposure evaluation = costly and labor-intensive
  - HCWs & patients
  - Post-exposure prophylaxis

Influenza Control: Vaccination
- Recommended for healthcare workers (HCWs) since 1984
- Part of comprehensive influenza control plan
  - Early identification and isolation of patients
  - Use of appropriate PPE
  - Education of staff and patients about respiratory hygiene
  - Exposure management plans

Hosted by Paul Webber paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com

Special thanks to:
Hilary M Babcock, MD, MPH
Assistant Professor of Medicine, Infectious Diseases
Washington University School of Medicine
Medical Director of Occupational Health (Infectious Diseases),
Barnes-Jewish and St Louis Children’s Hospitals

Hosted by Paul Webber
paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com

October 28, 2010
Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers

Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine
A Webber Training Teleclass

Influenza Vaccination of HCWs
- Decreases absenteeism
- Decreases nosocomial cases of influenza
- Decreases morbidity/mortality among patients in long term care settings.

Optimizing Vaccination of HCWs
- Recommended practices:
  - Free, Convenient, Education, Incentives/Rewards, Leadership, Champions
  - Declination statements
  - Mixed results
- National rates of HCW vaccination remain low
  - 44.4% in 2006-07; 49% 2007-08; 62% 2009-10
  - 2009 H1N1: 39.3%

Mandatory Vaccination
- Rationale:
  - Protection of public (patient) health
  - Like schools, other HCW vaccines (Hep B)
  - First do no harm
  - Safe vaccine
  - Also protects HCWs
  - Inadequacy of years of voluntary efforts
  - "Intentions and principles do not protect patients; results are needed." A. Pavia
  - See hand hygiene, SSI, "never events"

Mandatory Vaccination: Ethics
- Lots of literature
- Principles at stake:
  - Autonomy (HCW), individual rights
  - Non-malefeasance
  - Protection of public health ("state interest in public welfare")
  - Have less coercive methods been tried (and failed)

Mandatory Vaccination: Practicalities
- Defining mandatory:
  - What is mandatory: Vaccine? Vaccine/Declination?
  - Exemptions: Medical? Religious? Personal belief?
  - Consequences of non-compliance
  - Suspension/Termination of employment
  - Mandatory mask use
  - Monitoring and enforcement, consequences
  - Privacy/HIPPA issues
  - Protection (of HCW and pbt) vs. punishment

Reporting results
- Vaccination rates (vs. compliance rates)

Hosted by Paul Webber paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com
Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers
Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine
A Webber Training Teleclass

Increasing utilization...
- High interest level
- Abstracts and anecdotes at SHEA 2010
- "Honor Roll for Patient Safety"
  - Immunization Action Coalition
  - http://www.immunize.org/immunizehow.asp
  - e.g.: Hopkins, U of IA, HUPCHOP, Dept of Defense, (New York State), Loyola University Health System, UC Davis Health System
- Position Statements: IDSA, National Patient Safety Foundation, ACP, APIC
- Regulatory interest in vaccine offerings, vaccination rates...

Mandatory Program: (Potential) Barriers
- Fear of negative impact on employee-employer relationship
  - May be mitigated by clear communication, consistency, education, leadership.
- Fear of litigation
- Fear of union reaction
- Defining and dealing with exemptions, non-compliance
  - Masking? Suspension? Dismissal?

Mandatory Program: Benefits
- Improved vaccination coverage (Goal)
  - Herd immunity
  - Patient protection
    - (Decreased absenteeism)
  - Maintenance of workforce = patient safety issue
- Expectation of compliance; culture of safety
- Public expectation (Moms-on-the-street test)
- Facility ready for vaccination rate to be used as a standard/reportable measure
- Strength in numbers!

Reminders for mandatory programs
- Vaccination = one part of a comprehensive influenza control program
- Still need early identification/isolation of patients
- Still need education, FAQs for employees
- Still wise to have incentives, campaign themes, publicity
- Keep focus on safety and protection of patients and staff

Setting – BJC Healthcare
- Large non-profit healthcare organization
- 11 acute care hospitals in Missouri and Illinois
  - Urban, suburban, rural
  - Size 46 - 1250 beds
  - Two teaching hospitals (1 adult, 1 pediatric)
  - 3 long-term care facilities
- Home care, medical groups, behavioral health, occupational medicine
- > 25,000 employees

Hosted by Paul Webber  paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com
Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers  
Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine  
A Webber Training Teleclass

BJC Influenza campaigns
- Annual campaigns:
  - Free, convenient vaccine
  - Publicity, encouragement, incentives, raffles
  - Educational programs
  - Successful practices shared among facilities
  - Annual HCW vaccination rates between 40 - 54% from 1997-2006

BJC Influenza campaign: 2007
- Vaccination rates added to the BJC quality scorecard (goal 80%)
  - Leadership incentives by performance on score card measures
- Declination statements implemented for employees refusing vaccination
  - Declination stated value of vaccine for protection of self/family/patients
  - Not truly mandatory but highly encouraged
  - Lots of time and effort (not resulting in vaccination)

BJC Employee Vaccination Rates: 1997 - 2007

2007 BJC Influenza Vaccination Rates: By Hospital

2007 Results
- 17,894/25,199 active employees vaccinated (71.1%)
- ~ 4000 (16%) signed declination statements
- >3000 (13%) neither vaccinated nor signed declination statement

2008 Influenza Vaccination Policy
- Influenza vaccination = “condition of employment”
- All BJC employees, regardless of job function
  - Included all clinical staff, medical groups, hospital-employed and housestaff MDs, non-clinical staff, contracted clinical personnel, volunteers
  - Caveat: many private practice MDs and WUSM faculty and staff not BJC employees

Hosted by Paul Webber paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com
We know how to prevent flu. We know how to protect patients and co-workers from getting the flu. We should use everything we know to make sure that our patients have every opportunity to get better. After all, that's why we do what we do.” – Dave Lassen, BJC president and CEO

Program Communication
- Communication through managers, BJC newspaper, Town Hall Meetings, Intranet site, letters to employees, FAQs
- BJC CEO letter in BJC weekly newspaper explaining rationale for mandatory vaccination

Policy Implementation
- Free vaccine available, multiple sites and times, multiple brands starting October 2008
  - Included thimerosal free, LAIV
- Off site vaccination required documentation
- Exemptions could be requested
- Not vaccinated/exempt by 12/15/08 = suspension without pay (30 days or until vaccinated)
- Not vaccinated/exempt by 1/15/08 = termination

Exemption Process
- Religious accommodations required a letter to Human Resources from the employee stating a religious conviction opposed to vaccination
- Medical exemptions required a letter from a physician stating a medical contraindication to vaccination
- Reviewed by occupational health nurses, with review by medical director if needed

Results: 2008 - 09
- Active Employees: 25,980
  - Vaccinated: 25,561 (98.4%)
  - Exemptions: 411 (1.59%)
    - Medical Exemptions: 321
    - Religious Exemptions: 90
- Policy Compliant: 25,972 (99.96%)
- Non-compliant: 8 (0.03%)

Lessons Learned
- Misinformation about influenza and vaccine is common, among employees and their physicians
  - A pre-printed medical exemption form was developed with definitions of the accepted contraindications
  - Fewer employees sought exemptions (~400) than had signed declination statements the prior year (~4000)

Hosted by Paul Webber  paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com
Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers
Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine
A Webber Training Teleclass

2009 Update
- Seasonal AND H1N1
  - "Not a good year to start a mandatory program..." T. Frieden, CDC
- Concerns re: H1N1
  - Fear of worse disease = increased interest in vaccine (while not available)
  - Fear of "new vaccine" = decreased interest in vaccine (once available)

2009 Decision-making
- Lots of discussion of H1N1 vaccine, availability issues
  - "It's the flu, right? We have a vaccine, right?"
- Seasonal AND H1N1 both mandatory
  - Different deadlines for seasonal and H1N1
  - Deadlines for H1N1 varied by facility depending on county and availability

2009 Preliminary Results
- Seasonal influenza vaccination
  - 97.6% vaccinated
  - 2.1% exempt
  - 99.9% policy compliant
- H1N1 influenza vaccination
  - 96.8% vaccinated
  - 2.9% exempt
  - 99.7% policy compliant

Limitations/Generalizability
- Many attending physicians in private practice or employed by affiliated university, not covered by policy
  - ~ 900 (100%) residents/fellows complied
  - Hospital employed MDs and employed medical groups complied
- Economic factors
- Increasing rates the year before going mandatory might have continued to rise

Other Examples: Virginia Mason
- VMMC: 2005, >5000 employees
  - All hospital employees and MDs
  - No declinations allowed; religious or medical accommodations could be requested
  - If approved: mask all season

Other Examples: HCA
- Hospital Corporation of America, 2009
  - 163 hospitals, 112 surgery centers, 400 MD practices in US and UK
  - ~ 150,000 health care workers
  - Average 58% vaccination rate (20-74%)
  - Leadership; patient safety message
  - Religious, medical and personal belief exemptions allowed
  - 2009 seasonal influenza vaccination rate: 96.4%
    - 3.6% declined for any reason

Hosted by Paul Webber  paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com

Courtesy of Ed Sapienza, MD; Abstract SHEA 2010
Mandatory Influenza Vaccination for Healthcare Workers
Prof. Keith Woeltje, Washington University School of Medicine
A Webber Training Teleclass

BJC Acknowledgements
- BJC Council of Occupational Health Professionals
  - Director: Nancy Gemeinhart
- BJC Infection Prevention and Epidemiology Consortium
  - Clay Dunagan, BJC VP of Quality
  - Infection Prevention Specialists
- BJC Pharmacists
- BJC Administration, Human Resources and Legal Services

Questions????

The Next Few Teleclasses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Speaker/Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>04 Nov. 10</td>
<td>Using Social Marketing to Prevent Healthcare Associated Infection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09 Nov. 10</td>
<td>(British Teleclass) Why are Nonviruses Such Successful Pathogens in Healthcare Settings?</td>
<td>Dr. Christine Moe, Emory University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Nov. 10</td>
<td>Infection Prevention Strategies in the Home Care Setting</td>
<td>Mary McGoldrick, Home Health Systems Inc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02 Dec. 10</td>
<td>Validation of Special Ventilation Systems in Healthcare Facilities</td>
<td>Dr. Andrew Simor, Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09 Dec. 10</td>
<td>Do Decontamination Strategies Work for MRSA?</td>
<td>Dr. Michelle Aite, Diagnostic Services Manitoba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 Dec. 10</td>
<td>Clostridium difficile: The Sinister Spore Saga</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

www.webbertraining.com.schedulep1.php

Hosted by Paul Webber  paul@webbertraining.com
www.webbertraining.com