One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, MD, MPH, MPP
Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs
Princeton University

CME Disclosure

Dr. Laura Kahn is a research scholar with the Program on Science and Global Security, Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs, Princeton University. Her salary is supported by the Woodrow Wilson School of Public and International Affairs, Princeton University. She has received no other funding for the research and information she will be presenting.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance  
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University  
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

The One Health Concept

- One Health: a concept that recognizes the links between human, animal, and environmental health.
- Because they are linked, issues such as antibiotic resistance must be analyzed using a holistic One Health approach.
- The One Health Initiative:  
  [http://www.onehealthinitiative.com](http://www.onehealthinitiative.com)

A One Health Analysis

- United Kingdom  
- Sweden  
- Denmark  
- European Union  
- United States  
- History of Ban of Low Dose Antibiotics  
- Antibiotic Use  
- Antimicrobial Resistance (AMR)  
- Livestock Production  
- Healthcare Costs  
- Global AMR  
- Environmental AMR  
- Antibiotic R & D Issues

Disclaimer: I do not represent any of these country’s governments!  
All analyses and conclusions from government data are my own work.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc.  [www.virox.com](http://www.virox.com)  
A Webber Training Teleclass  
[www.webbertraining.com](http://www.webbertraining.com)
Evolution of Medicine and Agriculture in the 20th century

**Medicine**
- Increasingly specialized
- Technology driven
- Dependent on antibiotics
- Price of medical care increased

**Agriculture**
- Increasingly specialized
- Technology driven
- Dependent on antibiotics
- Price of food decreased

Uses of Antibiotics

- Livestock
  - Growth
  - Prevention
  - Treatment
- Humans
  - Prevention
  - Treatment

All uses lead to antibiotic resistance
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Defining Terms

- Low dose
- Sub-therapeutic
- Non-therapeutic
- Growth promoting
  All mean essentially the same thing.

- Typically mean levels as low as 1-2 parts per million in feed.
- Higher doses, up to 100 parts per million or higher used to treat sick animals.

Resistant *Salmonella typhimurium* and *Enterococcus faecium* drove policy

**Zoonotic Bacteria**
- Cause illness in both livestock and people. Major cause of food-borne illness.
- *Salmonella enterica* (subspecies: *Salmonella typhimurium*)
- *Campylobacter species.*

**Indicator Bacteria**
- Part of normal intestinal microbiome in both animals and people. Can cause life-threatening illnesses.
- *Escherichia coli* (*E. coli*)
- *Enterococcus* (*Enterococcus faecium* and *Enterococcus faecalis*)

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Why were antibiotics used as growth promoting agents?
Price of Beef and Pork in U.S., 1900-1969

Dollars/hundredweight

Before WWII, U.S. relied on fishmeal and cod liver oil to supplement feed


Accidental Discovery of Antibiotics as Growth Promoting Agents in 1940’s

Tom H. Jukes, PhD (1906-1999)
Biochemist and nutritionist

- Fed vitamin B12 to chicks and piglets
- Growth rates increased
- Residues from chlortetracycline
- Increased efficiency in agriculture.
- Adopted in many countries

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
FDA never “approved” antibiotics for growth promotion in livestock

- The Penicillin Amendment of 1945
- Allowed FDA to waive the requirements to ensure the safety and efficacy of penicillin-based drugs if doing so was considered safe.
- Waiver provided FDA the flexibility to approve antibiotics for purposes other than treating infections.
- In 1951 and 1953, respectively, FDA waived requirements for batch certification of antibiotics intended as growth promoting agents and preventive agents in livestock.
Since WWII, Cost of Food in U.S. Has Decreased


USDA: Percent of consumer expenditures spent on food, alcoholic beverages, and tobacco that were consumed at home by selected countries, 2014


Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass www.webbertraining.com
Can we have our pork chops and antibiotics too?

United Kingdom

- 1960’s: British Enteric Reference Lab (ERL) noted an increase in resistant *Salmonella typhimurium* in calves, appearing soon after farmers adopted intensive farming methods (separating calves from dams).
- Many animals got infected, developed infectious diarrhea, and died.
- Sick animals were treated with antibiotics and healthy animals were given antibiotics to prevent infections.
- Outbreaks in humans developed. One outbreak sickened almost 60 people who consumed raw milk of dairy cows infected with the organism.
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Swann Report 1969

Meredith Michael Swann, PhD
(Baron Swann) 1920-1990

Recommendations

- Divided antibiotics into three categories:
  - Feed antibiotics—growth promotion
  - Therapeutic antibiotics—treat illnesses
  - Prophylactic antibiotics—prevent illness
- Recommended banning feed antibiotics that have important human health uses.
- Feed antibiotics should be available without a prescription to pigs, poultry, and calves up to 3 months of age.
- Veterinarians should be able to prescribe any antibiotic for sick animals.
- Alternative methods of growth promotion should be investigated and developed.
- A committee to oversee antibiotic use in humans and livestock recommended.

Response to Swann Recommendations

- Farming and pharmaceutical industries voiced strong opposition.
- Recommendations based on scanty evidence.
- Outbreaks were due to poor animal husbandry practices rather than use of antibiotics.
- Rest of Swann recommendations were either implemented half-heartedly or ignored.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

UK Antibiotic Sales Data for Food Animals, 1998–2013


Antibiotic Sales by Drug Class and Animal Species, U.K. 1998-2013


Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
Sweden

- In 1977, in response to Swann Report, banned some antibiotics for growth promotion that were also used in clinical medicine.
- In 1981, series of newspaper articles in *Dagens Nyheter* (Daily News) reported that more than 30 tons of antibiotics used in animal feed for growth promotion each year. Public was outraged.

Swedish Farmers Pushed for Ban

- Federation of Swedish Farmers decided that a ban of antibiotic growth promoting agents would regain consumer confidence.
- Farmers wanted Swedish Parliament to pass a mandatory ban and wanted compensation from government to cover expenses for adjusting livestock production methods.
- They got the ban, but not the compensation.
- Feedingstuffs Act 1986.
- In 1988, Parliament passed strict animal welfare laws, maximum weaning age for pigs, space requirements for animals, etc.
- Sweden wanted to have the cleanest agriculture in the world and worked hard to make livestock *Salmonella* free.
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Overall Sales of Antimicrobial Drugs in Livestock, Sweden 1980-84, 2002-2012

Kg active substances

0 10000 20000 30000 40000 50000 60000


Swedish Veterinary Antimicrobial Resistance Monitoring (SVARM) 2000 and

Sales of Substitutes Increased

Sales of Ionophores Increased
Sales of Zinc Oxide Increased

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
Sweden joined the EU in 1995, unable to meet domestic consumer demand

The Rise of Vancomycin-Resistant *Enterococcus faecium* (VRE)

- In 1988, first case reports of VRE reported in seriously ill patients in Paris (acute leukemia) and London (End Stage Kidney Failure).
- Three months before the London VRE cases, a new policy was implemented: administer vancomycin and ceftazidime to all chronically ill (i.e. end stage kidney failure) patients with fever and undiagnosed infections.
- A few years later, VRE was isolated from food animals in England and Germany.
- Avoparcin, a growth promoting agent in livestock, chemically related to vancomycin and used in Europe since the early 1970’s, was implicated as the probable source of VRE in hospitals.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc.  www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
Relationship between Avoparcin and Vancomycin; Vancomycin is effective against both *E. faecium* and *E. faecalis*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Growth Promoting Antibiotic in Livestock</th>
<th>Related Antibiotic in Human Medicine</th>
<th>Antibiotic Class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Avoparcin</td>
<td>Vancomycin</td>
<td>Glycopeptide</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antibiotic</th>
<th><em>Enterococcus faecium</em></th>
<th><em>Enterococcus faecalis</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ampicillin/Gentamicin of Ampicillin/Cephraxone</td>
<td>+ increasing resistance</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancomycin</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vancomycin used to treat Gram positive bacteria.

*New Antibiotics:*
Quinupristin-Dalfopristin, approved by FDA Sept. 1999, only treats *E. faecium*
Linezolid, approved by FDA April 2000, only treats *E. faecium*

---

**Denmark**

- Danish scientists concerned about emergence of VRE and general use of antibiotics in livestock.
- Denmark relied heavily on avoparcin and other growth promoting antibiotics.
- In January 1995, VRE identified in fecal samples from healthy chickens and pigs in Denmark.
- Danish farmers concluded that they had to change their practices and stop using antibiotics as growth promoting agents.
Danish Growth Promoter Ban

- Farmers voluntarily stopped using avoparcin in May 1995.
- In 1997, the EU banned avoparcin.
- 1998, Denmark banned virginiamycin, another growth promoting antibiotic, related to quinupristin/dalfopristin, an antibiotic used to treat VRE.
- 1999, Danish farmers stopped using all antibiotic growth promoting agents in response to consumer concerns.
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Salmonella typhimurium Tetracycline resistance (%), Denmark, 1997-2013

Denmark: Ban Decreases VRE in Farm Animals! But not in hospitals

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Pig meat yield (mill.kg/1000 heads), Denmark, 1990-2013

![Graph showing pig meat yield (mill.kg/1000 heads) in Denmark from 1990 to 2013.](image)

DANMAP 2013, Page 21, Table 3.1

Danish pork exports and imports do not appear adversely affected by ban

![Graph showing pork exports and imports in Denmark from 1990 to 2010.](image)

Statistics Denmark; does not include processed swine meat.
DKK = Danish Kroner

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Denmark No Longer World’s Top Exporter of Pig Meat

European Union

- 2003, European Parliament passed regulations prohibiting all antibiotics as growth promoters.
- Used Precautionary Principle to set policy.
- Ban took effect January 1, 2006.
- European Union established a number of surveillance systems to assess antibiotic use and resistance.
- Reporting was voluntary for enterococcus in livestock, not possible to assess VRE rates in livestock before or after ban.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc.  www.virox.com)  
A Webber Training Teleclass  
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

EU countries vary widely in human antibiotic use

Cephalosporin Use 2011

Vancomycin Use 2011

No consistent trend in VRE isolates from hospitalized humans after 1997 EU avoparcin ban

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc.  www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
Human vancomycin use and VRE in hospitals are highly correlated

Evidence that 2006 ban adversely affected pig meat yield, 1996-2013

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc.  www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Relative Pig Meat Yield (EU/USA)
Approx. 3 percent decrease in relative yield after ban

Decrease in Yield Cost EU Approx. $1.1 Billion Per Year (in 2012 USD)

No effect on chicken production; EU did not ban coccidiostats

Food and Agriculture Organization FAOSTAT http://faostat3.fao.org/downloads/N/T/IE

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
United States

- US never approved avoparcin because of concerns about its carcinogenicity, so epidemiology of VRE has been different compared to Europe.
- Congress has spent decades debating the risks of growth promoting antibiotics.
- Consistently concluded that more data was needed, but never appropriated resources to get more data.
- Bureaucratic leaders at CDC, FDA, USDA scrounged together funds for NARMS and NAHMS.

VRE in U.S.

- VRE in US emerged in 1990’s in hospitals.
- Preceded spread in European hospitals by about a decade even though first few cases reported in Europe.
- CDC estimates that 77% of US healthcare-associated infections due to Enterococcus faecium are resistant to vancomycin.*
- CDC estimates approximately 10,000 VRE infections and 650 deaths per year.*
- Healthcare costs specifically for VRE not available.
- CDC estimates that >2 million people fall ill with resistant infections, 23,000 die, healthcare costs between $20 to $35 billion per year.*


One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Americans Used Much More Vancomycin than the Europeans:
Human vancomycin use (in kg) per capita per year


Outpatient antibiotic consumption,
by state in the US in 2010

The Center for Disease Dynamics, Economics & Policy, "Outpatient Antibiotic Use". Available online at: http://cddep.org/node/4933

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

Food-Producing Animals Primarily Use Tetracyclines and Ionophores (Coccidiostats) in U.S.

![Graph showing kilogram usage of different antibiotics from 2009 to 2012]

FDA Summary Reports on Antimicrobials Sold or Distributed for Use in Food-Producing Animals. Page 40, Table 10. NIR (Not Independently Reported)
http://www.fda.gov/ForIndustry/UserFees/AnimalDrugsUserFeeActADUFA/acm642896.htm

National Antibiotic Resistance Monitoring System (NARMS): Enterococcus faecium

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antibiotic</th>
<th>Chickens* 2003 (2216)</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>%Δ</th>
<th>Chicken Meat** 2002 (134)</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>%Δ</th>
<th>Pork Chops 2002 (93)</th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>%Δ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vancomycin</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linezolid</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quinupristine/ dalofluorin</td>
<td>36.9</td>
<td>65.8</td>
<td>+28.9</td>
<td>55.4^</td>
<td>32.1^</td>
<td>-23.3</td>
<td>24.7^</td>
<td>13.5^</td>
<td>-11.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NARMS does not collect Enterococcus faecium data on humans!

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com

24
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

National Animal Health Monitoring System (NAHMS): Resistant Enterococcus in Pigs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antibiotic</th>
<th>2006 (857)*</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>2012 (563)*</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vancomycin</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linezolid</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Total number of isolates tested.


Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference

U.S. Exports of Pork and Broiler Chickens Have Skyrocketed

![Graph showing U.S. pork and broiler trade trends](image_url)

**U.S. Pork Trade**
- **Imports**
- **Exports**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Imports</th>
<th>Exports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**U.S. Broiler Trade**
- **Exports**
- **Imports**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Exports</th>
<th>Imports</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Americans eat a lot of chicken

**Retail Prices/CPI: Chicken is cheaper than pork**
- Broiler Composit Retail Price/CPI
- Pork Retail Price/CPI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Broiler Composit Retail Price/CPI</th>
<th>Pork Retail Price/CPI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Per Capita Consumption**
- Broilers
- Pork

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Broilers</th>
<th>Pork</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

USDA Economic Research Service. Retail prices are in cents per pound. Broilers: Uncooked, whole, cut up, boneless, and frozen.

Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. [www.virox.com](http://www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
[www.webbertraining.com](http://www.webbertraining.com)
Comparing the EU and USA

**EU**
- Unclear why Europe approved avoparcin in the early 1970’s.
- Banned avoparcin after rise of VRE in food animals.
- Almost all VRE vanA*
- Banned all antibiotic growth promoting agents using Precautionary Principle.
- Evidence that total ban adversely affected pig meat production.
- No evidence that avoparcin ban decreased VRE in hospitalized humans.

**USA**
- Never approved avoparcin because of cancer concerns. (Precautionary Principle)
- Very high vancomycin use in hospitals
- VRE appeared in hospitalized patients about a decade before widespread in Europe.
- 70% vanA and 25% vanB*
- No evidence that VRE came from US livestock.
- Needed better data to do proper risk analysis before making any decisions.
- Implemented voluntary measures to stop using growth promoting antibiotics.


Confusing epidemiology of resistant bacteria: horizontal versus vertical gene transmission

- Until 2008, analysis of resistant microbes focused on resistance genes on plasmids.
- Horizontal transmission: exchange of genetic material between microbial contemporaries.
- vanA, vanB, vanD acquired resistance genes spread among VRE.
- Cost of genome sequencing cost $10 million per genome.
- After 2008, cost plummeted.
- Allowed sequencing of microbial genomes.
- Vertical transmission (parent to offspring) of genetic material.
- Genomic data revealed surprising findings.
VRE genomic data suggests a surprising culprit

- One or two VRE clones caused initial outbreaks, proliferating into multiple clones, and becoming endemic in hospitals. VRE CC17
- Hospital associated VRE appears to be genetically distinct from VRE in livestock and from healthy people in the community.
- Genetic analysis suggests that VRE precursor came from an animal, just not the livestock that everyone assumed...


Teleclass broadcast sponsored by Virox Technologies Inc. www.virox.com)
A Webber Training Teleclass
www.webbertraining.com
VRE precursors (AREF CC17) genetically related to VRE CC17 in hospitals have been isolated in dogs

Two Danish studies

1. First Danish study analyzed fecal specimens from 127 healthy dogs and found 20 *E. faecium* isolates resistant to ampicillin. One isolate was related to VRE CC17. Only 14 dogs had been treated with antibiotics within 6 months of the study.

2. Second Danish/UK study found ampicillin resistant *E. faecium* in 61/208 dogs. Only 1 person out of 18 tested positive—a 10 year old boy. 1 in every 4 dogs tested had AREF CC17, precursor to VRE CC17.

Conclusions

- Denmark’s ban of avoparcin decreased VRE in pigs and poultry.
- No evidence that EU ban in 2006 decreased VRE in hospitals.
- Evidence that EU ban adversely affected pig meat yield in Europe compared to the US.
- Antibiotic use varies widely between states and countries showing large variations in how medicine is practiced.
- Surveillance must include microbial genomes.
- Antibiotic resistance in pets is potentially an important hidden source of resistance in humans.
- Antibiotic resistance surveillance should include pets.

- One Health Initiative *pro bono* team:
  - Bruce Kaplan, DVM
  - Tom Monath, MD
  - Jack Woodall, PhD
  - Lisa Conti, DVM, MPH

http://www.onehealthinitiative.com
One Health and the Politics of Antibiotic Resistance
Laura H. Kahn, Princeton University
Broadcast live from the 2016 IPAC-Canada Conference